

APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Friday 25 November 2005

Teleconference

Meeting Start: 11:00 am (UTC+10)

Minutes

Present:

Akinori Maemura (Chair)
Che-Hoo Cheng
Billy Cheon
Qian Hualin
Vinh Ngo
Kuo-Wei Wu
Ma Yan

Paul Wilson
Irene Chan
Connie Chan
Geoff Huston
Save Vocea
Gerard Ross (minutes)

Agenda:

1. Agenda bashing
2. Minutes from last meeting (19 October 2005)
3. Financial report for October 2005
4. EC endorsement of APNIC 20 policy proposals
5. Next EC election
6. Appointment of AC member
7. ICANN/NRO status
8. WSIS update
9. AOB

1. Agenda bashing

The following topics are also to be discussed:

- APRICOT 2007

2. Minutes from last meeting (19 October 2005)

- The minutes from the meeting on 19 October 2005 were discussed and approved.
- **Action ec-05-024:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 19 October 2005.

3. Financial report for October 2005

- On the statement of activities, the actual 2005 expenses were used for the budget comparison, against projected total expenses for 2006.
- It was noted that in the earlier part of the year, it is useful to use a pro rata budget, but towards the end of the year, it is more useful to make a projection including any large sums expected to be spent between now and the end of the year.

- The extent of the budget variance was explained.
- It was also noted that December has three salary periods, rather than two, which can be confusing in the pro rata reporting.
- The unspent ICANN contributions are expensed each year, which puts the value onto the balance sheet.
- APNIC continues to pay ITU-T and ITU-D membership. It was noted that there may be a need to discuss certain issues of the ITU's current activities.
- The current financial report shows the equal best month for membership growth. The increased rate of membership growth will flow into next year and will be taken into account for the 2006 projections.
- The EC approved this report.

4. EC endorsement of APNIC 20 policy proposals

- The EC was asked to review the progress of the policy proposals which have passed through the policy development process. The EC has received a summary of the proposals, their progress through discussion lists and meetings, and the decisions made by the relevant SIG chairs.

[prop-005-v005] Internet Assigned Numbers Authority (IANA) policy for allocation of IPv6 blocks to Regional Internet Registries (global policy)

- There were no further comments received on the mailing list in the final comment period. The Chair noted that consensus had been achieved.
- The EC ratified that the process was correctly followed and that consensus had been properly achieved.
- The EC formally endorsed this proposal.

[prop-028-v001] Abolishing IPv6 per address fee for NIRs

- This proposal reached consensus during APNIC 20, but has since been subject to much discussion and several objections during the final comment period.
- At the end of the final comment period the SIG chair noted that no consensus had been reached to adopt this proposal.
- There was a discussion of the nature of consensus. The relevant provisions of the APNIC Policy Development Process were explained.
- There had been a suggestion of holding a discussion between certain NIR staff and the Secretariat; however, it was decided that it would not be appropriate for the APNIC staff to be involved in this way in relation to judgments of the SIG chairs or the EC.
- It was noted that because the SIG chair has judged that there is no consensus, there is no requirement for the EC to discuss this proposal. However, it was noted that the EC is free to discuss any issue and may wish to consider the circumstances surrounding this proposal.
- It was suggested that the EC should not make any decision on this proposal and that further discussion should be referred back to the mailing list.
- It was noted that there have been discussions on the mailing list to form a working group of interested parties to develop this proposal further. There was a discussion of the procedure for establishing a working group.
- It was suggested that the current challenge to the decision of the SIG chair is still SIG matter and that the chair has not called on the EC to intervene.
- It was suggested that unless this matter is officially referred to the EC then the EC should not make any decision in relation to the matter.

- It was suggested that there are two aspects of the fee schedule that could be considered unfair. One is the difference between large and small ISPs and the other is the difference between NIR members and regular members. It was suggested that it is preferable to address the fee schedule as a whole in preference to just the per-address fee issue.
- It was noted that there is no requirement to provide an extension for discussion of the issue to continue on the SIG discussion list.
- However, it was noted that the Secretariat should formally acknowledge the decision of the SIG chair, noting that there is an expectation that this proposal will be discussed further.
- **Action ec-05-025:** Secretariat to formally acknowledge the decision of the SIG chair on prop-028-v001 at the end of the eight-week period, noting that there is an expectation that this matter will be discussed further on the mailing list.

[prop-030-v002] Deprecation of ip6.int reverse DNS service in APNIC

- There were no further comments received on the mailing list in the final comment period. The Chair noted that consensus had been achieved.
- The EC ratified that the process was correctly followed and that consensus had been properly achieved.
- The EC formally endorsed this proposal.

[prop-031-v002] Proposal to amend APNIC IPv6 assignment and utilisation requirement policy

- The Chair noted that consensus had been achieved, although he did note that there had been at least one objection.
- It was also noted that the proposal was made conditional on the adoption of a similar proposal in the other RIRs. It is intended to be pursued only as a globally coordinated policy.
- It was suggested that changing the HD-ratio figure may have an impact on the per-address fees paid by NIRs. There was a discussion about the potential fee impacts of this proposal may have, which are not addressed in the proposal itself.
- It was suggested that the EC could choose to ratify the proposal with a stipulation about the fee issue.
- It was noted that the membership have explicitly accepted a change to the HD ratio value, but have not yet been asked to consider the fee implications.
- The EC ratified that the process was correctly followed and that consensus had been properly achieved. The EC formally endorsed this proposal, subject to its implementation not having an effect on the per-address fee schedule.

5. Next EC election

- The EC was reminded that online voting is to be used for the next EC election. The Secretariat has reviewed the terms of the ByLaws and determined that paper ballots and proxy votes should continue to be used at the next election.
- It was noted that the election scrutineers expressed satisfaction with the conduct of the online election for the AC election.
- It was noted the ByLaws require that electronic votes must be submitted 48 hours before the AMM.
- It was noted that the Secretariat will need to carefully communicate the requirements of the electronic voting to ensure that members are not confused by the procedures.

6. Appointment of AC member

- The EC is required to appoint one new AC member to fill Kenny Huang's expiring position. This will need to be done by the end of the year.

- It was also noted that Kenny Huang will continue as an AC member as he was elected to another position, which commences at the start of 2006.
- It was noted that two nominations have been raised by EC members.
- It was suggested that the EC members could vote on this issue by email, then confirm the selected nominee's willingness to serve.
- **Action ec-05-026:** Secretariat to coordinate EC members' online vote for the AC appointment.

7. ICANN/NRO status

- The NRO incorporation documents now appear to be finalised and ready to be signed. Incorporation will proceed after signing.
- The NRO EC will meet with ICANN during the ICANN meeting in Vancouver, to discuss issues including the Guam transfer issue, NRO incorporation, and progress of the contract with ICANN.

8. WSIS update

- There was a review of the third PrepCom meeting, which continued into the beginning of the WSIS meeting. A final agreement was reached just before the start of WSIS.
- Two documents were agreed, the Tunis Agreement and the Tunis Agenda.
- In the end, there was no final agreement on the proposed paragraph regarding equitable distribution of IP addresses, so references to this were abandoned in the final documents.
- There is a paragraph included recognising the importance of the regional address management institutions (RIRs). A late change to this, however, was a statement of the role of the regional institutions in ensuring national rights to manage Internet resources.
- There was also agreement to establish the Internet Governance Forum, based on broad, multi-stakeholder principles, although the details of this remain vague. However, it is expected that the IGF will be constituted along similar lines to the WGIG.
- The first meeting of the IGF is scheduled to be held in Athens before the middle of 2006.
- Most people generally agreed that the IGF is a reasonable outcome, although it could go on for a long time and may have significant impacts on APNIC activities and budgets in the future.
- There was discussion of the call for an "enhanced cooperation model". There is speculation that the wording of this allows a lot of room for the interpretation by various actors, and this will need to be watched carefully.

9. AOB

APRICOT 2007

- The APRICOT management committee is aware of the APNIC EC's previous position on travel to areas that subject to strong travel advisories. They are also aware of local security issues and have noted the planned meeting is to be held in a venue with high security procedures.
- The APRICOT management committee would like to discuss this issue in detail with the APNIC EC.
- There was a discussion of the need to seek legal advice about potential liability of sending staff and delegates to an area subject to travel advisories.
- It was suggested that in the future, APNIC should call for meeting proposals in time to allow one year advance notice, rather than six months as is the current practice.
- **Action ec-05-027:** Secretariat to seek legal advice on travel liability, to be reported in time for the December EC meeting.

10. Next meeting

- tba

Meeting closed: 12:50 pm (UTC+10)

Open action items

- **Action ec-05-024:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 19 October 2005.
- **Action ec-05-025:** Secretariat to formally acknowledge the decision of the SIG chair on prop-028-v001 at the end of the eight-week period, noting that there is an expectation that this matter will be discussed further on the mailing list.
- **Action ec-05-026:** Secretariat to coordinate EC members' online vote for the AC appointment.
- **Action ec-05-027:** Secretariat to seek legal advice on travel liability, to be reported in time for the December EC meeting.