

# APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Thursday 14 May 2004

*Meeting Start: 15:00*

## Minutes

### Present:

Akinori Maemura (Chair)  
Che-Hoo Cheng  
Qian Hualin  
Kuo-Wei Wu

Paul Wilson  
Irene Chan  
Geoff Huston  
Connie Chan  
Gerard Ross (minutes)

### Apologies:

Yong Wan Ju

### Agenda:

1. Agenda bashing
2. Minutes from last meeting (8 April 2004)
3. Financial report for April 2004
4. New membership fee schedule
5. EC approval for APNIC 17 consensus policy decisions
6. VNNIC NIR status
7. ICANN status
8. AOB

#### 1. Agenda bashing

The following topics are also to be discussed:

- none.

#### 2. Minutes from last meeting (8 April 2004)

- The minutes from the meeting on 8 April 2004 were discussed and approved subject to an amendment correcting the reference to the previous minutes.
- **Action ec-04-010:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 8 April 2004 (subject to amendment as described).

#### 3. Financial report for April 2004

- The EC received financial reports in both AU and US dollars. The AU dollar version was the formal report for this meeting, in accordance with the EC's previous request. The US dollar version was provided for reference only.

- It was noted that APNIC is currently running at about 6.3 percent below the projected budget. There was a discussion of the unrealised foreign exchange gain shown in the current report.
- The operating cash reserves have reduced and there is currently about \$800,000 in receivables, of which \$300,000 have aged more than 30 days. However, it was clarified that the amount actually considered due for payment is considerably less than that figure and is in fact lower than it has been at this time in other years.
- There was a request to include the exchange rate in future reports to provide additional reference.
- It was noted that one Large member downgraded to Medium during the report period.
- It was noted that currently 82 percent of the cash holding is in AU dollars. However, the US dollar cash holding will continue to increase as further membership income accrues.

#### 4. New membership fee schedule

- It was explained that an earlier decision of the EC relating to implementing a membership reactivation fee was never formally documented in EC minutes. Formal minuting of the decision is now required so that the new fee schedule may be released.
- The EC reviewed the new documentation and formally approved the reactivation fee.

#### 5. EC approval for APNIC 17 consensus policy decisions

- The EC reviewed the policy proposals that received consensus at APNIC 17.

##### **[prop-014-v001] A proposal to lower the IPv4 minimum allocation size and initial allocation criteria in the Asia Pacific region**

- There were no objections to the proposal received on the mailing list (although there was a single mail relating to the use of the word 'consensus'). The EC endorsed the consensus of the AMM.

##### **[prop-015-v001] Should APNIC allocate global unicast IPv6 address space to 'unconnected' networks?**

- There were no objections to the proposal received on the mailing list. The EC endorsed the consensus of the AMM.

##### **[prop-016-v002] IPv6 allocations to organisations with existing IPv4 infrastructure**

- There were no objections to the proposal received on the mailing list (although there was a single mail relating to the use of the word 'consensus').
- It was noted that this policy has been adopted in the RIPE region and that there have been requests on the basis of this policy. One ISP has received a /20 allocation on the basis of this policy. There has been some discussion of this policy at the IAB.
- There was discussion of how the IPv4 and IPv6 networks were mapped to each other in evaluating these requests.
- It was noted that in IPv4 networks there is widespread DHCP modem pooling. This is not required in IPv6, where ISPs are able to assign a /48 to each customer.
- It was noted that this policy could lead to high consumption levels.
- It was also noted that the HD ratio is again under discussion in the IAB.
- It was explained that this proposal reflects the original intention of the current IPv6 policy. However, based on the way the current IPv6 policy was written, there was confusion about how to apply the policy. Therefore, this proposal only clarifies the policy in a way that it is already being applied in other parts of the world.
- It was noted that this proposal would likely be welcomed by places where there are large networks.
- The EC endorsed the consensus of the AMM.

### **[prop-017-v001] Recovery of unused address space**

- There were no objections to the proposal received on the mailing list.
- It was clarified that this proposal will apply to both historical and current address space.
- APNIC is the first of the RIRs to make a policy along these lines. It has been reported to the other RIRs. There have been no objections raised in those other forums.
- It was clarified that the ERX project is continuing and APNIC has received several /8s of historical space already. Once ERX blocks come under APNIC's management, this policy will apply to them.
- When address space is reclaimed, it will not be reallocated immediately.
- There needs to be clarification of whether or not reclaimed address space is to be returned to IANA or to the NRO.
- It was also noted that if all unused address space around the world were to be recovered, it would be extremely fragmented. Therefore, it should be dealt with in a centralised way that would allow re-aggregation.
- It was clarified that the intention is that APNIC space which is recovered should be reused by APNIC, but that historical address space recovered would not be used by APNIC.
- The EC endorsed the consensus of the AMM.
- **Action ec-04-011:** Paul Wilson to raise issue of ERX resource recovery with NRO EC.

### **[prop-018-v001] Protecting historical records in the APNIC Whois Database**

- There were no objections to the proposal received on the mailing list.
- It was clarified that the fee for maintainers in this proposal is USD\$100 annually.
- The EC endorsed the consensus of the AMM.

## **6. VNNIC NIR status**

- The VNNIC membership agreement and the endorsement of VNNIC was approved by the EC in June 2003, for a period of one year. VNNIC has submitted a report of their activities and operations, which appear to be satisfactory and stable. The APNIC hostmasters have reported that the VNNIC allocation procedures appear to be stable and present no particular problems.
- It was noted that the existing NIRs do not have time limits on their status.
- The EC expressed full endorsement of VNNIC's status as an NIR. This endorsement carries no time limit.
- It was suggested that APNIC should consider review periods for all NIRs. This matter should be raised for discussion within the NIR SIG.

## **7. ICANN status**

- The APNIC comment period for the NRO ICANN agreement expires on 31 May 2004. All other RIR comment periods have expired already.
- There have been some comments on the GAR Boards list, which will need to be considered before finalising the document.
- It was noted that some people have asked about a transition plan from the old Address Council to the new one. The details of this may have implications for the AC election scheduled for later this year.
- **Action ec-04-012:** Secretariat to include discussion of AC transition plan on the agenda of the June meeting.

## 8. AOB

- none.

## 9. Next meeting

- 11 June, 11:00 UTC + 10.

*Meeting closed: 16:05*

## Open action items

- **Action ec-04-010:** Secretariat to publish minutes from 8 April 2004 (subject to amendment as described).
- **Action ec-04-011:** Paul Wilson to raise issue of ERX resource recovery with NRO EC.
- **Action ec-04-012:** Secretariat to include discussion of AC transition plan on the agenda of the June meeting.