

APNIC EC Meeting Minutes

Friday 17 May 2002

Meeting Start: 11:10 am

Minutes

Present:

Che-Hoo Cheng (Chair)
Geoff Huston
Akinori Maemura
Kuo Wei Wu

Paul Wilson
Connie Chan
Irene Chan
Gerard Ross (minutes)

Apologies:

Xing Li

Agenda:

1. Agenda Bashing
2. Minutes from last meeting (19 Apr 2002)
3. Financial reports for April 2002
4. IPv6 policy implementation and fee structure
5. AC election procedure
6. AOB

1. Agenda Bashing

The following items were added to the draft agenda:

- ICANN issues (proposed budget, contract).

2. Minutes from last meeting (19 Apr 2002)

- It was requested to remove the action item included in section 2 of the draft minutes, as it is covered later in the minutes.
- The minutes as amended were then approved by consensus of the meeting.
- Review of action items. Regarding section 6, action 2, it was suggested that another GAR Boards meeting would be needed before the next RIR statement on ICANN reform is drafted.
 - **Action ec-02-003:** Secretariat to amend minutes as described and publish.
 - **Action ec-02-004:** Secretariat to organise a GAR Boards meeting.

3. Financial reports for Apr 2002

- It was noted that revenues are down on projections by 4.5 %, and expenses are being controlled accordingly. It was noted that in accordance with the EC's direction, APNIC paid half of our outstanding dues to ICANN, for the two invoices received from ICANN for the periods to June 2001. An invoice has since been received for the year ending June

2002, and half of this amount will be paid during June. The other RIRs have already made payment for this period.

- It was noted that membership growth is still slow and there have been ongoing member closures. There was a review of the breakdown of new memberships and cancellations, as provided in the financial report for April.
- It was explained that the "optional" closures are those where a member notifies us that their business is closing, or that their membership is otherwise not required. In these cases they always return their resources to APNIC. The non-contactable closed members reflect a mixture of circumstances, including several which never received resources.
- There was an explanation of the resource recovery procedures currently being followed by APNIC staff.
- It was also noted that in future it may be possible to provide the service suggested relating to providing a BGP feed of unallocated address space.
- It was suggested that as closures are now becoming more important, it is necessary to take stronger measures to prevent the resources being used without financial contribution.
- It was also noted that APNIC will be shortly send a reminder to all members by post, that transfer of resources and memberships is not recognised without authorisation by APNIC.
- It was suggested that when members become uncontactable, APNIC needs to act promptly to recover resources.

4. IPv6 policy implementation and fee structure

- There was a review of the status of the new IPv6 policy. It was noted that the new policy principles have now been approved in the open policy meetings of each RIR.
- During APNIC's open policy meeting in Bangkok, the IPv6 policy was discussed and approved, however a specific implementation date was not proposed or decided. Now that a policy is approved globally, implementation work is underway in APNIC and is expected to be complete in approximately six weeks.
- However, it was explained that fee structure has not yet been updated to reflect the new IPv6 policy. It was explained that under our current pricing model, a minimum allocation of address space should correspond to the "Small" member category, and that for IPv6 the minimum allocation is being increased from /35 to /32.
- It was noted that under the new policy, any existing IPv6 /35 holder may opt to increase their allocation from /35 to /32. Those who do not would move from the small category to very small under the new pricing proposal.
- It was suggested that this decision should be deferred until it can be discussed at the next member meeting, however it was also noted that the effect of the proposal is either no change or a reduction of fees for all members.
- It was suggested that a statement be posted on the web site advising of the EC recommendation to change the fee structure, and further that in the absence of objections, this change will be implemented.
- It was agreed that although implementation of the IPv6 policy was not specifically addressed in the last member meeting, the approval of the policy obliges the Secretariat to implement the policy within a responsible timeframe as proposed.
- **Action ec-02-005:** Secretariat to proceed with IPv6 policy implementation; and seek membership comments within 30 days on amended the fee structure.

5. AC election procedure

- The previous discussions relating to this item, as reported in the Bangkok meeting minutes, were reviewed. It was noted that there was clear consensus to maintain the status quo in relation to nominations. However, there was no clear preference expressed in relation to the voting procedure.

- In relation to the proposal to restrict voting to those who had previously attended APNIC meetings, it was noted that APNIC does have records of attendance at previous meetings, however these records are not able to be audited and difficulties could arise in verifying those attendance records.
- It was noted that if voting were restricted to members, then there may still be issues about distribution of votes according to membership category
- In relation to the possibility of a low-cost individual membership, it was noted that feasibility has not been formally investigated by the Secretariat, but there would be staffing implications if there was a large number of new memberships in this category.
- It was suggested that there would not be time to implement individual membership before the next meeting.
- Concern was raised that the proposal of a new type of APNIC membership would raise concerns of existing members and would not be approved. It was argued that creating a separate organisation would defuse that problem.
- It was suggested to proceed with next election as per usual, but at that meeting, ask whether there is a desire to form a new, low cost membership body (separate from APNIC) which could provide a constituency for the AC elections. Such a body could have a defined membership and a defined role. It was suggested that in the initial years, APNIC could host the secretariat for that body.
- There was a question about combining the status quo with a proxy vote for APNIC members who are unable to attend. However it was argued that proxy voting may not be sufficient to overcome the problem of the host city dominating the election, which was the primary motivation for a new voting structure.
- It was resolved to run the AC election and meeting in the same way as previous years, and for the APNIC EC to present a series of options to that meeting for alternative ways of managing electoral participation. This presentation would present options for discussion but not make recommendations.
- It was also noted that possible changes in the ICANN structure would become clearer by the time of the next AC election, and will strongly influence the discussion.
- **Action ec-02-006:** EC to prepare an options statement for presentation at the next AC election.

6. AOB

ICANN proposed budget

- It was noted that the new ICANN budget has been through the annual budget review process prior to ICANN board consideration at the next meeting. The budget group meetings were attended by EC representatives.
- The budget proposed by Stuart Lynn has been increased substantially. It was noted that the revenue increase suggested for RIR contributions has been limited in accordance with the limits set in the draft RIR-ICANN contract.
- It was noted that the main suggested budget increases are taken up by staffing increases.
- It was noted that the budget relies on considerable cooperation from cc-TLD registries.
- There was a reminder of the next ICANN meeting in Bucharest next month.

ICANN contract

- It was noted that there have been no comments received from APNIC members.
- It was agreed that if EC members are called on to attend the ICANN meeting in Bucharest, then APNIC will fund their attendance.

Meeting closed: 12.20 pm

Open action items

- **Action ec-02-001:** GH to encourage the GAR Board to finalise the statement of principles so that it may be published and discussed (pending action ec-02-004).
- **Action ec02-002:** EC members to send travel details for Yokohama meeting to Secretariat as soon as possible.
- **Action ec-02-003:** Secretariat to publish minutes of 19 April 2002 meeting as amended.
- **Action ec-02-004:** Secretariat to organise a GAR Boards teleconference meeting.
- **Action ec-02-005:** Secretariat to seek membership comments within 30 days on the proposal to amend the fee structure.
- **Action ec-02-006:** EC to present an options statement at the next AC election.